# **Product: Computer Efficiency**

# Description:

Manufacturer incentives will be offered for desktop computers that are either Energy Star or 80 Plus labeled at a bronze, silver, gold, and platinum levels. Incentives are administered via Ecos Plug Load Solutions PLS. Prescriptive rebates offered for end-use customers for installing VDI (Virtual Desktop Infrastructure) devices, also known as "Thin Client" systems instead of new PCs. PC Power Management is a prescriptive measure for an office-type occupancy which will provide customers with rebates for installing centralized PC power management software. Commercial customer incentives for installing servers with power supplies rated higher than Silver. At the moment, Silver efficiency power supplies are eligible for incentive. All eligible servers are required to have redundant power supplies.

# Algorithms:

#### General

Gross Coincident kW Saved at Customer per Unit (kW)	= Customer kW x CF

# Upstream Manufacturer Incentives:

Gross kW Saved at Customer per Unit (kW)	= (Baseline Computer kW - Efficient PS Computer kW) * Cooling kW factor * Quantity
Gross Annual kWh Saved at Customer per Unit (kWh/yr)	= (Baseline Computer kWh - Efficient PS Computer kWh) * Cooling kWh factor * Quantity
UMI Energy O&M Savings	= Customer kWh (Baseline Computer kWh - Efficient PS Computer kWh) * Heating Penalty Factor * Gas Cost * Quantity

### Desktop PC Virtualization:

Gross kW Saved at Customer per Unit (kW)	= (Baseline Computer kW - Virtualized kW) * Cooling kW factor * Quantity
Gross Annual kWh Saved at Customer per Unit (kWh/yr)	= (Baseline Computer kWh - Virtualized kWh) * Cooling kWh factor * Quantity
VDI Energy O&M Savings	= ( Gustomer kWh (Baseline Computer kWh - Virtualized kWh) * Heating Penalty Factor * Gas Cost * Quantity ) + ( Quantity * ( O&M-Hours Savings + O&M-License Cost ) )

### Network PC Power Management:

Gross kW Saved at Customer per Unit (kW)	= ( kW_Base - kW_EE ) x Cooling kW factor * Quantity
Gross Annual kWh Saved at Customer per Unit (kWh/yr)	= ( kW_Base - kW_EE ) x Hours x Cooling kWh factor * Quantity
PCPM Energy O&M Savings	= ( Gustomer kWh ( kW, Base - kW, EE ) x Hours * Heating Penalty Factor * Gas Cost * Quantity ) + ( Quantity * Q&M-License Cost )

### High Efficiency Power Supply Server:

Power Supply reduction kW	= Baseline Power Supply kW - Proposed Power Supply kW				
Power Supply Output Wattage	nput wattage * number of power supplies * load factor				
Baseline Power Supply kW	= Power Supply Output Wattage / (1000 * Silver Efficiency)				
Baseline Power Supply kWh	= Baseline kW * hours of operation				
Proposed Power Supply kW	= Power Supply Output Wattage / (1000 * Proposed Efficiency)				
Proposed Power Supply kWh	= Proposed kW * hours of operation				
Cooling Interaction kW	= PS Cooling Load (tons) * Cooling System kW/ton [per temperature bin]				
Cooling Interaction kWh	= Cooling Interaction kW * Cooling System Hours [per temperature bin]				
PS Cooling Load (tons)	= Power Supply Reduction (kW) * 3413 / 12000				
Gross kW Saved at Customer per Unit (kW)	= Power Supply Reduction + Cooling Interaction kW				
Gross Coincident kW Saved at Customer per Unit (kW)	= Gross kW Saved at Customer per Unit * Coincidence Factor				
Gross Annual kWh Saved at Customer per Unit (kWh/yr)	= ( Power Supply Reduction * Hours of Operation ) + Cooling Interaction kWh				

### Variables:

General:		
Customer kW	Calculated	Per measure kW savings value.
CF	Table 8	Probability that the calculated 'customer kW' will coincide with the period of generator peak operation
Cooling kW factor	Table 7	Average annual demand of cooling system necessary to cool the heat gain from the equipment (Ref. 10).
Cooling kWh factor	Table 7	= Average annual energy of cooling system necessary to cool the heat gain from the equipment (Ref. 10).
Heating Penalty Factor (Dth/kWh)	Table 7	= Average annual energy of heating system necessary to compensate for the negative heat gain associated with the more efficient equipment (Reference 10).
Gas Cost	\$5.56	=Average Forecast Utility Cost (\$/Dth) of Commercial Gas
Upstream Manufacturer Incentives: Baseline Computer kW	Table 3	Average baseline computer energy demand (= Baseline Computer kWh / 8760 *Quantity)
Baseline Computer kWh	Table 3	Average baseline computer energy usage (= UBE* PC Frequency *) Quantity)
baseline Computer RWII	Table 3	Average baseline computer energy usage ( - OEC PC Prequency Quantity)
PC Frequency	Table 2	PC Frequency of Operating Patterns = Assumed % of the population that enables power management software in one of four available configurations (power management enabled, computer turned off; power management enabled, computer left on; power management not enabled, computer left on (Reference 4); this is used to estimate average kWh usage over the entire population.
UEC	Table 3	Unit Energy Consumption = Sum of the products of the wattages and the annual hours in the four states of operation (active, idle, sleep, off) = (Active Wattage *Active Annual Hours of Operation)+(Idle Wattage * Idle Annual Hours of Operation)+(Sleep Wattage * Sleep Annual Hours of Operation)+(Off Wattage*Off Annual Hours of Operation) = Wattages are shown in Table 1 and Hours in each state are shown in Table 2.
Efficient PS Computer kW	Table 3	Average wattage demand of High Efficiency Power Supply
Efficient PS Computer kWh	Table 3	Average energy usage of High Efficiency Power Supply
Quantity		# of computers with a more efficient power supply
Measure Life	5 years	Average life of desktop computers (Reference 1)
Incremental Cost	Table 1	Cost of high efficiency model over baseline model
Net-to-Gross	88%	Reference 17
Desktop PC Virtualization:		
Baseline Computer kW	Table 5	Societal aggregate baseline computer energy demand (= Baseline Computer kWh / 8760 *Quantity)
Baseline Computer kWh	Table 5	Societal aggregate of baseline computer energy usage * Quantity
Incremental Server kW	0.00401	Average energy usage per virtualized server = 273W (per Server) / 68 Virtual Machines (per Server) - Ref.8
Hours	8760	Average 'on' hours for a virtualized server
Quantity		# of VDI (thin client) devices installed instead of a desktop PC computer
VDI kW		kW of VDI product (provided by the customer) (Ref 25 for forecasting)
Measure Life	10 years	(Reference 9)
Incremental Cost	\$117.00	Cost of high efficiency model over baseline model (Reference 6)
Net-to-Gross	88%	Calculated by applying a market penetration % of the efficient computer power supplies to the wattage and kilowatt-hour savings amount at five baseline levels.  If our program was not in place, some of the customers that bought VDI boxes would have bought desktop computers at ESTAR 5 or higher.
0&M - Hours Savings	1/2	Hours Per Year per desktop @ \$85/hr
O&M - License Cost	\$12.00	Software License Fee per year per desktop
Network PC Power Management:		
kW Base	Table 5	Average weighted computer kW WITHOUT centralized power management.
kWh Base	Table 5	Average weighted computer kWh WITHOUT centralized power management.
kW EE	Table 5	Average weighted computer kW WITH centralized power management.
kWh EE	Table 5	Average weighted computer kWh WITH centralized power management.
Hours	Table 6	Average PC hours broken out by operational state
Quantity	145.6	# of computers to be equipped with network power management control
Measure Life	6 Years	Length of time software will be utilized (Reference 16)
Baseline Cost	\$0.00	Cost of the baseline technology. (The baseline is to continue to operate the existing system.)
Incremental Efficiency Cost	\$14.64	Cost of the High Efficiency technology = average of various vendor products (Reference 12)
Net-to-Gross	88%	Aligns with the Computer Efficiency program as a whole
O&M - License Cost	\$2.74	Software License Fee per year per desktop
	ΨΒ., 1	1000000 100000 per

# High Efficiency Power Supply Server:

Proposed Efficiency	See Table 8	Power supply efficiency is dependent on efficiency level and loading
Power Supply input wattage	750	rated wattage of the power supply
HVAC System Type	Chilled Water	HVAC system type serving the data center where the power supplies will be installed. There are five options and the customer must indicate which option best matches their system. The options are shown in Table 10 below.
Load Factor	See Table 9	Power supply load factor
Number of Power Supplies	2	each power supply contains two power supplies for 100% redundancy. Load factors take the redundancy into account.
Hours of operation	8760	Servers operate all hours of the year
Chiller Efficiency (COP)	5.55	Assumed efficiency of data center central centrifugal chiller (ASHRAE 90.1-2001 (150-300 tons, centrif) page 34, Table 6.2.1L). Converted to kW/ton for use in the analysis.
DX Efficiency (EER)	9.5	Assumed efficiency of DX CRAC units (ASHRAE 90.1-2001 (>=240,000 BTU/h and <760,000 BTU/h, air cooled DX) page 27, Table 6.2.1A). Converted to kW/ton for use in the analysis
Glycol-Cooled DX Efficiency (EER)	11	Assumed efficiency of glycol (water) cooled DX CRAC units (ASHRAE 90.1-2001 (>=240,000 BTU/h, water cooled air conditioners) page 27, Table 6.2.1A). Converted to kW/ton for use in the analysis.
Cooling Tower Fan Energy (GPM/HP)	20	ASHRAE maximum cooling tower fan energy requirement (ASHRAE 90.1-2001 Centrif. Cooling Tower Fan Power, page 32, Table 6.2.1G) used to determine the cooling tower fan power/ton, along with the GPM/ton assumption.
Cooling Tower Sizing Factor (GPM/ton)	3	Standard cooling tower sizing rule of thumb (Ref 19,20,21)
Primary Chilled Water Pump Power (HP)	5	Assumed, based on assumed chiller size and typical primary pump size
Primary Chilled Water Pump Load	75%	Assumed, based on rule-of-thumb for pump load factor
Primary Chilled Water Pump Motor Efficiency	89.50%	Assumed, based on NEMA Premium motor efficiency for 5-hp motors
Chiller Size (tons)	150	Assumed, based on minimum chiller size within range used for chiller efficiency determination. This and the primary chilled water pump assumptions only affect the primary pump analysis and are only a very small portion of the total savings for this measure.
Measure Life (Retrofit)	5	Lifetime (in years) of the measure. Ref 18.
Desired Chilled Water Temperature (F)	45	Chilled water supply temperature. This is a typical value for most chilled water systems.
Cooling Tower Approach (F)	7	Cooling tower approach (difference between outdoor air wet bulb temperature and condensing temperature). Values can range from 4-12 F, but 7 is typical.
Cooling Tower Design Wet Bulb Temperature (F)	69	Assumed design wet bulb temperature for cooling towers installed in the relevant location (69 F used for CO), based on weather data.
Chiller Minimum Efficiency Dry Bulb Temperature (F)	93	Assumed design dry bulb temperature for chiller in the relevant location (93 F used for CO), based on weather data.
Chiller Maximum Efficiency Dry Bulb Temperature (F)	30	Assumed dry bulb temperature below which the chiller's efficiency will not decrease any further.
Dry Cooler Dry Bulb Approach Temperature (F)	15	Dry cooler approach (difference between outdoor air dry bulb temperature and condensing temperature). 15 F is the most common value (Ref 23)
Cooling Equipment Temperature-based Efficiency Improvement (%/F)	0.50%	Assumed efficiency improvement for chiller and DX systems (and, for simplicity, cooling tower fans) based on outdoor dry bulb temperature decrease (due to lower condenser pressure). Standard Xcel Energy assumption for cooling interaction.
Net-to-Gross	88%	To match overall program. Program will be evaluated in 2016.

Table 1: Desktop Computer Wattages

					Incremental	
					Cost	Notes
Desktop Computer	Avg Active Watts (W)	Idle (W)	Sleep (W)	Off /Standby (W)	(reference 5)	
Baseline Aggregate	68.69	32.29	1.89	0.70		References 5,28,29
ES 6.0 or 80 Plus Bronze Qualified	58.48	24.93	1.60	0.57	\$9.00	Reference 5
ES 6.0 or 80 Plus Silver Qualified	56.63	24.14	1.60	0.57	\$14.00	Reference 5
ES 6.0 or 80 Plus Gold Qualified	55.40	23.62	1.60	0.57	\$16.00	Reference 5
ES 6.0 or 80 Plus Platinum Qualified	54.17	23.09	1.60	0.57	\$22.00	Reference 5

Table 2: Annual Hours in each Operational State and Frequency of PC Operation Patterns (PC Frequency)

				Standby / Off		N
Computer State	Active (Hrs/year)	Idle (Hrs/year)	Sleep (Hrs/year)	(Hrs/year)	PC Frequency	Notes
Power managed (local), turned off	175	5,011	431	3,143	18.7%	Reference 3
Not power managed (local), turned off	175	5,442	0	3,143	66.3%	Reference 3
Power managed (local), left on	175	5,687	2,898	0	3.3%	Reference 3
Not power managed (local), left on	175	8,585	0	0	11.7%	Reference 3

Table 3: Energy and Demand Savings (Reference 1-5, 28, 29)

		Computer	Computer	Cooling Watts	Cooling Peak	Customer kW	Customer kWh	
Desktop Computer	UEC	Watts	kWh/yr	Cooling watts	kWh	Savings	Savings	Heating Dth Penalty
Baseline Aggregate	N/A	23.7	207	7.8	27			
ES 6.0 or 80 Plus Bronze Qualified	666	18.4	161	6.1	21	0.0070	52.2	-0.023
ES 6.0 or 80 Plus Silver Qualified	645	17.8	156	5.9	20	0.0078	57.9	-0.026
ES 6.0 or 80 Plus Gold Qualified	632	17.4	153	5.8	20	0.0083	61.7	-0.028
ES 6.0 or 80 Plus Platinum Qualified	618	17.1	149	5.6	19	0.0088	65.5	-0.029

Table 4: Computer Annual kWh and Average kW (Reference 11, 15, 26, 27)

	No centralized PC Power	Management	With centrali	% of Program	
Desktop PC	kWh_Base	kW_Base	kWh_EE	kW_EE	Participation
ENERGY STAR 3.0 Desktop PC	337.66	0.0385	117.04	0.0134	0.00%
ENERGY STAR 4.0 Desktop PC	319.03	0.0364	111.65	0.0127	4.50%
ENERGYSTAR 5.0 Desktop PC	255.13	0.0291	91.45	0.0104	12.00%
ENERGYSTAR 6.0 Desktop PC	174.16	0.0199	65.99	0.0075	83.50%
Aggregate of Society	190.40	0.0217	71.10	0.0081	100.00%

Table 5: Hours of Operation (Reference 11, 13, 14 & Table 2 - for non-network aggregate operation.)

Table 5. Hours of Operation (Reference 11, 15, 14 & Table 2 - for Hour-network aggregate operation.)							
Desktop PC	Active	Idle	Sleep	Off	Total		
Not network power managed, left on	175	8,150	435	0	8,760		
Not network power managed, turned off	175	5,377	65	3,143	8,760		
Network power managed, left on	175	1,631	6,954	0	8,760		
Network power managed turned off	175	1.631	431	6,523	8,760		

Table 6: Secondary Cooling/Heating Values

rable of secondary cooling/ ficating values				
Location	kW	kWh	Dth/kWh	Notes
Front Range	1.33	1.13	-0.000508	Reference 10
Western Slope	1.33	1.137	-0.000508	Reference 10
Mountain	1.33	1.098	-0.000704	Reference 10

**Table 7: Per Measure Coincidence Factors** 

Upstream Manufacturer Incentives	100%
Desktop PC Virtualization	100%
PC Power Management	0%
High Efficiency Server Power Supply	100%

Table 8: Power Supply Efficiency

Loading	Silver	Gold	Platinum	Titanium
5%	75.1%	80.2%	85.6%	90.6%
10%	79.0%	83.4%	87.9%	92.1%
15%	82.9%	86.5%	90.2%	93.5%
20%	86.8%	89.6%	92.5%	94.9%
30%	88.0%	90.6%	93.1%	95.3%
40%	89.2%	91.5%	93.7%	95.8%
50%	90.4%	92.5%	94.3%	96.2%
60%	90.1%	92.2%	94.0%	95.9%
70%	89.8%	92.0%	93.7%	95.6%
80%	89.5%	91.8%	93.4%	95.3%
90%	89.2%	91.5%	93.2%	95.1%
100%	88.9%	91.3%	92.9%	94.8%

Ref 18, 22

Table 9: Power Supply Load Factor

Loading	% operating hours				
Loading	Hi Performance	Bus Computing			
5%	5%	10%			
10%	10%	55%			
15%	55%	30%			
20%	30%	5%			
30%	0%	0%			
40%	0%	0%			
50%	0%	0%			
60%	0%	0%			
70%	0%	0%			
80%	0%	0%			
90%	0%	0%			
100%	0%	0%			

Ref 18, 22

Table 10: Cooling System Efficiencies

Tuble 10: cooling bystem Emerciales			
HVAC System Type	Efficiency	kW/ton	Notes
Chilled Water	5.55 COP	0.634	kW/ton is the rated efficiency
DX	9.5 EER	1.263	kW/ton is the rated efficiency
Glycol-Cooled DX	11 EER	1.091	kW/ton is the rated efficiency
Glycol-Cooled DX with Waterside Economizer	N/A	0.756	kW/ton is calculated from weather data and includes free cooling
Chilled Water with Waterside Economizer	N/A	0.407	kW/ton is calculated from weather data and includes free cooling

Table 11: Cooling Efficiency Table (kW/Ton)

Table 11: Cooling Eniciency Table (kw/Ton)				Water-Cooled DX	Water-Cooled
				w/WS	Chiller w/WS
Temperature	Water-Cooled Chiller	DX	Water-Cooled DX	Economizer	Economizer
Determinate Temperature: (dB/wB)	Wet Bulb	Dry Bulb	Dry Bulb	Dry Bulb	Wet Bulb
-3	0.4584	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0036
-1	0.4584	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0036
1	0.4584	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0036
3	0.4584	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0036
5	0.4584	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0036
7	0.4584	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0036
9	0.4584	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0043
11	0.4584	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0052
13	0.4584	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0065
15	0.4584	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0083
17	0.4584	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0108
19	0.4591	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0145
21	0.4601	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0202
23	0.4613	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0297
25	0.4645	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0468
27	0.4766	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.0817
29	0.4903	0.8653	0.8316	0.1231	0.1141
31	0.4993	0.8716	0.8377	0.2252	0.1141
33	0.5202	0.8842	0.8498	0.3307	0.1141
35	0.5468	0.8968	0.8619	0.4397	0.1141
37	0.5924	0.9095	0.8741	0.5522	0.1141
39	0.6314	0.9221	0.8862	0.6682	0.6314
41	0.6385	0.9347	0.8984	0.7876	0.6385
43	0.6492	0.9474	0.9105	0.9105	0.6492
45	0.6514	0.9600	0.9226	0.9226	0.6514
47	0.6587	0.9726	0.9348	0.9348	0.6587
49	0.6735	0.9853	0.9469	0.9469	0.6735
51	0.6808	0.9979	0.9591	0.9591	0.6808
53	0.6871	1.0105	0.9712	0.9712	0.6871
55	0.6971	1.0232	0.9833	0.9833	0.6971
57	0.7086	1.0358	0.9955	0.9955	0.7086
59	0.7167	1.0484	1.0076	1.0076	0.7167
61	0.7172	1.0611	1.0198	1.0198	0.7172
63	0.7284	1.0737	1.0319	1.0319	0.7284
65	0.7303	1.0863	1.0440	1.0440	0.7303
67	0.7302	1.0989	1.0562	1.0562	0.7302
69	0.7512	1.1116	1.0683	1.0683	0.7512
71	N/A	1.1242	1.0805	1.0805	N/A
73	N/A	1.1368	1.0926	1.0926	N/A
75	N/A	1.1495	1.1047	1.1047	N/A
77	N/A	1.1621	1.1169	1.1169	N/A
79	N/A	1.1747	1.1290	1.1290	N/A
81	N/A	1.1874	1.1412	1.1412	N/A
83	N/A	1.2000	1.1533	1.1533	N/A
85	N/A	1.2126	1.1654	1.1654	N/A
87	N/A	1.2253	1.1776	1.1776	N/A
89	N/A	1.2379	1.1897	1.1897	N/A
91	N/A	1.2505	1.2019	1.2019	N/A
93	N/A	1.2632	1.2140	1.2140	N/A
95	N/A	1.2632	1.2140	1.2140	N/A
97	N/A	1.2632	1.2140	1.2140	N/A
99	N/A	1.2632	1.2140	1.2140	N/A
101	N/A	1.2632	1.2140	1.2140	N/A
103	N/A	1.2632	1.2140	1.2140	N/A
103	14/21	1.2032	1.2110	1.2110	.1/11

Table 12: Power Supply Costs and Market Share

Watts	Silver	Gold	Platinum	Titanium	Market Share
300	\$ 30.00	\$ 37.50	\$ 50.00	\$ 67.50	10%
500	\$ 40.00	\$ 47.50	\$ 60.00	\$ 77.50	50%
750	\$ 50.00	\$ 57.50	\$ 70.00	\$ 87.50	25%
1400	\$ 65.00	\$ 72.50	\$ 85.00	\$ 102.50	15%

Ref 18, 23

Table 13: Incremental Cost per Power Supply (\$)

Server Efficiency	min			max	avg		
silver to gold	\$	5.00	\$	10.00	\$	7.50	
gold to platinum	\$	10.00	\$	15.00	\$	12.50	
platinum to titanium	\$	15.00	\$	20.00	\$	17.50	

Ref 18, 23

Table 14 Incremental Cost per Server

Server Efficiency	Server Wattage Range							
Server Efficiency		<400	400-600		600-1000		>1000	
Gold	\$	11.63	\$	13.88	\$	16.13	\$	18.38
Platinum	\$	31.00	\$	37.00	\$	43.00	\$	49.00
Titanium	\$	58.13	\$	69.38	\$	80.63	\$	91.88

Ref 24

Table 15: Assumed Allocation of Cooling Systems (For Forecasting purposes)

Type of Cooling System	% Allocation
Chiller	20%
DX	20%
Water-Cooled DX	20%
Water-Cooled DX with WSE	20%
Chiller with WSE	20%

#### References:

- 1. Koomey, J., M. Cramer, M.A. Piette and J. Eto. 1995. "Efficiency Improvements in U.S. Office Equipment: Expected Policy Impacts and Uncertainties." Lawrence Berkeley Laboratory. LBL-37383. December. Table 3.
- 2. Energy Star Calculator Tool; LBNL 2007 or Energy Star Specification
- 3. Hours of operation for desktop computers from office desktops/laptops and office monitors from Piette, M. A., M. Cramer, J. Eto and J. Koomey. 1995. "Office Technology Energy Use and Savings Potential in New York." Prepared for the NY State Energy
- 4. LBNL Estimate based on Reference 3
- $5. \ Ecos \ Consulting \ information \ from \ manufacturers$
- 6. Vendor data; see "Ref Cost-PC Virt" worksheet
- $7. \ Baseline \ desktop \ PC \ cost \ assumed \ at \$600; info from \ the \ internet \ indicates \ a \ PC \ with \ keyboard \ averages \ between \$300-\$1,000 \ or \$650; assumed \ the \ keyboard \ is \$50 \ of \ that \ (Ref 6)$
- 8. Server Wattages from Custom Efficiency program participant; average wattage of 42 models. (Wattages last confirmed in 2014)
- 9. 10-year life for thin-client and zero-client based on conversation with MN vendor Nowmicro
- 10. Based upon Rundquist Method Calculation (Matches Colorado Commercial Lighting Program)
- 11. Ecos Consulting (now Ecova), 2009
- 12. Various Equipment Vendors
- 13. Measured Energy Savings and Performance of Power-Managed Personal Computers and Monitors, 1996, Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory
- 14. PC and Monitor Night Status: Power Management Enabling and Manual Turn-off, 1998, Lawrence Berkeley National Laboratory
- 15. ENERGY STAR, 2012
- 16. Xcel Energy Custom Efficiency projects
- 17. 2014 Michaels Energy (independent 3rd party) NTG review.

# References (continued):

- 18. Ecova, multiple discussions
- 19. Cooling Plant Optimization (http://academic.udayton.edu/kissock/http/EEB/LecturesAndHomework/23-CoolingPlantOptimization/CoolingPlantOptimization.docx)
- $20.\ Georgia\ Tech\ Student\ Thesis\ (http://www-old.me.gatech.edu/energy/students/liuthesis.pdf)$
- 21. Condenser Water Energy Savings (

http://web.stanford.edu/group/narratives/classes/08-09/CEE215/Reference Library/Chillers/York%20 Engineering%20 Updates/Reduced%20 condenser-library/Chillers/York%20 Updates/Reduced%20 condenser-library/Chillers/York%20 Updates/Reduced%20 condenser-library/Chillers/York%20 Updates/Reduced%20 condenser-library/Chillers/York%20 Updates/Reduced%20 condenser-library/Chillers/York%20 Updates/Reduced%20 condenser-library/Chillers/York%20 Updates/Reduced%20 Updates/Reduced%20 condenser-library/Chillers/York%20 Updates/Reduced%20 Updates/water%20flow%20rate\_energy-saving%20miracle%20or%20mirage.pdf)

- 22. Server Power Supplies Data Points\_PMO.XLS supplied by Ecova on 9/1/14
- 23. 80 Plus Servers Calculator\_Xcel14Aug2014.xlsx file provided by Ecova on 9/1/14
- 24. Internal adjustment by Xcel energy to distribute power supply cost in a commensurate with wattage served. Values will be reviewed over time as additional information becomes available.
- 25. Energy Star 6.0 Product Database, downloaded on 12/21/15
- $26. \ Energy \ Star \ Office \ Equipment \ Calculator, accessed \ 12/21/15 \ from: http://www.energystar.gov/buildings/facility-owners-and-managers/existing-buildings/save-energy/purchase-energy/purchase-energy/saving-products$
- 27. Energy Star 5.0 Product Database, downloaded on 12/21/15 from historical archive
- 28. ECOVA Sales market share analysis, Feb. 2016.
- 29. 2013 EPA Study for Energy Usage of Average Computer Sold

### Changes from Previous Filing:

- 1. Adjusted average societal baseline for PC Power Management and VDI Measures to increase shift to ES 5.0 computers. Refer to Table 5.
- 2. Revised the NTG to match the findings of the 2014 third-party review.
- 3. Addition of High Efficiency Power Supply Server Measure
- 4. Adjusted baselines for PC Virt, PC power management, and upstream power supplies to account for changing societal baseline and energy efficiency programs (Energy Star)
- 5. Reformatted Forecast worksheets to include forecast lines at top, remove unnecessary material, and improve usability
- 6. Added ENERGY STAR 6.0 to PC Power Management, Virtualization, and Upstream Power Supplies
- 7. Adjusted ENERGY STAR 5.0 wattage values using new data
- 8. Consolidated "Forecast Measures" worksheets for several products into their "Forecast kW kWh" worksheets for simplicity
- 9. Updated Upstream program to use ES 6.0 Bronze Power Supply baseline